Learning the Curve

An Introduction to the Yield Curve and What it Means

The yield curve has been a major focus in the financial press this year—for both the stock and bond markets. In this piece, we discuss what the yield curve is, why it’s important, how to interpret it and importantly what it is—and is not—telling us right now.

WHAT IS THE YIELD CURVE?

The yield curve is simply the relationship between bond yields and maturities. In most market environments, longer-term bonds yield more than short-term bonds. Longer-term bonds have more risk—lower liquidity, greater price volatility, and more sensitivity to interest rates and inflation. Higher yields are compensation for this risk.

A graph of Treasury yields versus Treasury maturities will show that yields increase as maturities increase. However, it’s important to note that while yields do rise with maturities, they do so at a decreasing rate. For example, the yield difference between a 15-year and a 10-year Treasury is generally less than the yield difference between a 10-year and 5-year Treasury. This creates a convex “curve”—hence the phrase “yield curve.”

When longer-term rates are higher than short-term rates, this is called an upwardly sloping or “normal” curve.

When longer-term rates are lower than short-term rates, this is called a downward-sloping or “inverted” curve.

Exhibit 1: The Current Yield Curve and an Example of an Inverted Curve

A graph of Treasury yields versus Treasury maturities will show that yields increase as maturities increase. However, it’s important to note that while yields do rise with maturities, they do so at a decreasing rate. For example, the yield difference between a 15-year and a 10-year Treasury is generally less than the yield difference between a 10-year and 5-year Treasury. This creates a convex “curve”—hence the phrase “yield curve.”

When longer-term rates are higher than short-term rates, this is called an upwardly sloping or “normal” curve.

When longer-term rates are lower than short-term rates, this is called a downward-sloping or “inverted” curve.

Exhibit 1: The Current Yield Curve and an Example of an Inverted Curve

Source: Bloomberg, September 12, 2018 (current) and January 1, 2007 (inverted).
WHAT ARE THE MAJOR YIELD CURVES?

The yield curve technically refers to the entire yield versus maturity spectrum—from overnight to 30 years. As shorthand, however, most participants compare two yields at two specific maturity dates and refer to that as "the curve." When people discuss the yield curve, they are usually referring to some version of the Treasury curve—yields versus maturities for U.S. Treasurys. (Very rarely the reference may be to the corporate curve, for investment grade corporate bonds, or the municipal curve, for tax-exempt bonds.)

There is, therefore, more than one yield curve. For U.S. Treasurys, the most commonly referenced curves are:

1. The 2-year / 10-year curve ("2s/10s," pronounced "twos-tens.")
   - This is the difference between the 10-year Treasury Note yield and the 2-year Treasury Note yield.
   - This is the yield curve metric most frequently discussed by investors, asset managers and market pundits, as both of these Treasurys are actively traded, making it a popular way to place bets on the direction of the curve.

2. The 3-month / 10-year curve ("3m/10s," pronounced "three months-tens.")
   - This is the difference between the 10-year Treasury Note yield and the 3-month Treasury Bill yield.
   - This is more often the metric discussed by policymakers and economists.
   - It has a long history in academic literature, and has historically been the most accurate curve for economic forecasting.

3. The Fed Funds / 10-year curve ("FF/10s," pronounced "Fed Funds-tens.")
   - This is the difference between the 10-year Treasury Note yield and the Federal Funds Rate.
   - This is also more generally used by policymakers, and is very similar to 3m/10s curve as the 3-month Treasury Bill yield quickly incorporates near-term expectations for Fed Funds rate moves.
   - This is also the official curve used in the Conference Board Leading Economic Index—the most widely watched leading macroeconomic indicator for the U.S. economy.

If it is not specified, and you’re listening to an investor or pundit, assume they are discussing 2s/10s. If you’re listening to or reading a Federal Reserve (Fed) speaker, academic or trained economist, assume they are discussing 3m/10s. If in doubt, ask the speaker to clarify!

WHAT DOES IT MEAN FOR A CURVE TO BE “FLAT” OR “STEEP”?

When the difference between long and short rates is large, the curve is referred to as “steep.” When long rates increase faster than short rates—or conversely when short rates drop more quickly than long rates—the curve is getting steeper, or “steepening.”

Steep curves imply that monetary policy is accommodative—that is, because short rates are lower than long rates, banks have an incentive to create credit by borrowing at lower short-term rates and lending at higher long-term rates. This is one of the principal mechanisms the Federal Reserve uses to manage monetary policy—it lowers short-term interest rates, which should stimulate lending and thus help the economy.

When the difference between long and short rates is small, the curve is referred to as “flat.” When long rates increase more slowly than short rates—or conversely when short rates rise more quickly than long rates—the curve is said to be getting flatter, or “flattening.”

Flattening curves imply that monetary policy is becoming more restrictive—that is, because short rates are getting closer to long rates, the incentives for banks to lend is diminished. As short rates approach long-term rates, the short-term rate is said to be approaching its "neutral" level—that is, the rate which is neither stimulative nor restrictive for the economy as a whole.

Exhibit 2: Types of Yield Curve

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>30</th>
<th>40</th>
<th>50</th>
<th>60</th>
<th>70</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overnight</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Example Curves: Steep versus Flat

Source: Chief Investment Office. Data for illustrative purposes.
HOW DOES THE SHAPE OF THE CURVE RELATE TO THE BUSINESS CYCLE?

If we think of the business cycle as occurring in four stages—an expansion that leads to a peak, followed by a recession that results in a trough, which leads to a recovery that becomes the next expansion—the yield curve has behaved in a similar way historically in each of the four stages. This is not a coincidence or mere correlation, as the Fed’s monetary policy—the largest factor that drives the shape of the yield curve—helps dictate the business cycle.

During an expansion, the economy is growing, unemployment is decreasing and inflation is increasing. The Federal Reserve will be raising the Fed Funds rate to stop the economy from growing too quickly and stoking inflation. This leads to short rates moving up faster than long rates, and the curve flattens. At some point, to stop an economy from overheating, the Federal Reserve may increase the Federal Funds rate to above the 10-year Treasury rate. This is generally near the peak of the economic cycle, when the long-term rate is signaling that the Fed will likely be cutting rates in the near future. An inverted FF/10s curve has preceded every recession over the last 50 years, and the FF/10s curve has never inverted without a recession following in the next 18-24 months based on U.S. economic data. This is one reason why the yield curve is such an important metric to watch. It tells you when monetary policy is becoming restrictive enough to cause a recession.

Once the recession occurs, unemployment increases and high inflation is no longer a concern, and the Fed will begin cutting rates to engineer a so-called soft landing—a gradual shift from strong growth to slower growth, in contrast to a hard landing where the shift is rapid. This helps stimulate the economy by spurring bank lending and credit creation, as discussed above. As the Fed cuts rates, short rates drop more quickly than long-term rates, and the curve steepens.

Once the recession troughs, the recovery takes hold and the rate-cutting cycle ends, the curve peaks in steepness. This recovery will eventually turn into the next expansion, and the cycle repeats.

One way to visualize the link between the yield curve and the business cycle is to use the unemployment rate as a proxy for the business cycle. The unemployment rate is highly correlated with the business cycle, rising when the economy is doing poorly, and falling when it is doing well. Because of this, comparing unemployment to the yield curve highlights the connection.

WHAT IS THE CURVE CURRENTLY TELLING US?

Although the 2s/10s curve is very flat at ~0.2%—which has had many market participants expressing concern—as you can see in Exhibit 3, the FF/10s curve is still over 1%. As mentioned, FF/10s—as well as 3m/10s—are more accurate than 2s/10s as economic indicators. Notably, they are currently still accommodative, close to their average levels over the last 50 years, and actually significantly wider than at previous points in the cycles when unemployment was this low.

The curve flattening we have seen thus far is normal and expected. (In fact, it has been our prediction for several years now.) Yield curve flattening on its own is not a concern; inversion is, and we believe the yield curve is still several rate hikes away from any inversion. The Fed may hike interest rates two more times based on our baseline for total hikes in the federal funds rate for 2018. If the 10-year Treasury does not move upwards at all, that will likely mean an increase in the Fed Funds rate of 0.50% and consequently a flattening of the FF/10s curve to ~0.6%—which would almost certainly still mean no inversion (yet). Fed Chairman Jerome Powell has said he is currently not looking to end the expansion and is wary of over-tightening unnecessarily, and will likely continue to move at a slow and measured pace as the economy develops; you can find further details in the September 10, 2018 edition of our Capital Market Outlook publication.

Debate is heating up, however, over the need for a potential pause in the rate cycle based on continued curve flattening. If the Fed does continue to raise rates and the 10-year
yield stays below 3%, the curve will be approaching a level close to inversion. This would imply the market is saying that the Fed has become too restrictive with the Fed Funds rate, rather than simply neutral—a mistake the Fed wants to avoid. An inversion signal would likely prompt a pause in the rate hike cycle by the Fed, or even a cut to avoid an unnecessary recession.

If the Fed lets the economy run, however, inflation pressures may pick up. Paradoxically, a patient Fed—one less inclined to raise rates—may cause the curve to steepen if long rates rise due to investor concern about these inflationary pressures. The Fed staying “lower for longer” could potentially see long rates move higher relative to short rates—a re-steepening of the curve.

Currently, the yield curve is indicating that the Fed may stop raising rates earlier than stated—the Fed is now forecasting two more hikes in 2018, three in 2019 and one in 2020. This is somewhat reminiscent of 2000 and 2007, when it could be argued that the Fed tightened too early by inverting the yield curve in periods when inflation was not that high. In fact, average inflation fell short of the Fed’s 2% target for the next decade following the 2007 inversion. At the time, there were many explanations for why these inversions did not portend a recession, why “this time is different.” In fact, those indications were not different—the inversion provided the usual advance warning that policy was too tight and a recession was imminent.

We believe an inverted yield curve—both then and now—accurately forecast increased recession probabilities. We are skeptical of any similar arguments for why “this time is different” now, be it the effects of quantitative easing or more significant long-term demand for long-dated bonds by pension funds (since Americans are living longer). One implication of the Fed’s risk-management approach is that the downside from letting inflation heat up is much less than the downside from causing an unnecessary recession. This makes ignoring the yield curve potentially a far costlier mistake, especially after the experiences of 2000 and 2007. We will continue to monitor how short- and long-term rates react and will be listening closely to what the curve tells us.
INDEX DEFINITIONS

The Conference Board Leading Economic Index is an American economic leading indicator intended to forecast future economic activity. It is calculated by The Conference Board, a non-governmental organization, which determines the value of the index from the values of ten key variables.

IMPORTANT DISCLOSURES

This material was prepared by the Chief Investment Office (CIO) and is not a publication of BofA Merrill Lynch Global Research. The views expressed are those of the CIO only and are subject to change. This information should not be construed as investment advice. It is presented for information purposes only and is not intended to be either a specific offer by any Merrill Lynch or U.S. Trust entity to sell or provide, or a specific invitation for a consumer to apply for, any particular retail financial product or service that may be available.

Global Wealth & Investment Management (GWIM) is a division of Bank of America Corporation. Merrill Lynch Wealth Management, Merrill Edge®, U.S. Trust, and Bank of America Merrill Lynch are affiliated sub-divisions within GWIM. The Chief Investment Office, which provides investment strategies, due diligence, portfolio construction guidance and wealth management solutions for GWIM clients, is part of the Investment Solutions Group (ISG) of GWIM.

While some of the information included draws upon research published by BofA Merrill Lynch Global Research, this information is neither reviewed nor approved by BofA Merrill Lynch Global Research. This information and any discussion should not be construed as a personalized and individual recommendation, which should be based on your investment objectives, risk tolerance, and financial situation and needs. This information and any discussion also is not intended as a specific offer by Merrill Lynch or U.S. Trust, their affiliates, or any related entity to sell or provide, or a specific invitation for a consumer to apply for, any particular retail financial product or service. Investments and opinions are subject to change due to market conditions and the opinions and guidance may not be profitable or realized. Any information presented in connection with BofA Merrill Lynch Global Research is general in nature and is not intended to provide personal investment advice. The information does not take into account the specific investment objectives, financial situation and particular needs of any specific person who may receive it. Investors should understand that statements regarding future prospects may not be realized.

Investing involves risk, including the possible loss of principal. Any investment plan should be subject to periodic review for changes in your individual circumstances, including changes in market conditions and your financial ability to continue purchases.

It is not possible to invest directly in an index.

Asset allocation, diversification, dollar cost averaging and rebalancing do not ensure a profit or protect against loss in declining markets.

Investing in fixed-income securities may involve certain risks, including the credit quality of individual issuers, possible prepayments, market or economic developments and yields and share price fluctuations due to changes in interest rates. When interest rates go up, bond prices typically drop, and vice versa. Income from investing in municipal bonds is generally exempt from Federal and state taxes for residents of the issuing state. While the interest income is tax-exempt, any capital gains distributed are taxable to the investor. Income for some investors may be subject to the Federal Alternative Minimum Tax (AMT).

Past performance is no guarantee of future results.

Neither Merrill Lynch, U.S. Trust nor any of their affiliates or advisors provide legal, tax or accounting advice. You should consult your legal and/or tax advisors before making any financial decisions.

The Private Banking and Investment Group is a division of MLPF&S that offers a broad array of personalized wealth management products and services. Both brokerage and investment advisory services (including financial planning) are offered by the Group’s Private Wealth Advisors through MLPF&S, a registered broker-dealer and registered investment adviser. The nature and degree of advice and assistance provided, the fees charged, and client rights and Merrill Lynch’s obligations will differ among these services.

The banking, credit and trust services sold by the Group’s Private Wealth Advisors are offered by licensed banks and trust companies, including Bank of America, N.A., Member FDIC, and other affiliated banks.

MLPF&S is a registered broker-dealer, registered investment adviser, Member SIPC and wholly owned subsidiary of BofA Corp.

© 2018 Bank of America Corporation. All rights reserved.